

MINUTES
HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION WORK SESSION
April 19, 2018

COMMISSIONERS PRESENT

Carroll Cottingham
Jamie French
Andrew Hendrie
Lindsey Kerr
Russell Schutte
Kevin Sund – Chair
Jennifer Timbrook – Vice Chair

COMMISSIONERS ABSENT

Nicholas Larson (Un-Excused)
Sarah Pearson (Excused)

STAFF PRESENT

Kimberli Fitzgerald, Historic Preservation Officer
Lisa Anderson-Ogilvie, Deputy Community
Development Director & Planning Administrator
Natasha Zimmerman, Deputy City Attorney
Sally Long, Recorder
Kirsten Straus, Historic Intern

1. CALL TO ORDER:

Chair Kevin Sund, called the meeting to order at 5:33 P.M.

Roll call was taken and quorum was established.

2. PUBLIC COMMENT: None

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

a. Minutes of February 15, 2018

Motion: Move to approve the minutes from February 15, 2018 as presented.

Motion by: Commissioner Timbrook

Seconded by: Commissioner Hendrie

Questions or Comments by: None

Vote:

Aye: Cottingham, Hendrie, French, Kerr, Sund, Schutte and Timbrook

Nay:

Absent: Larson, Pearson

Abstentions:

Action: Moved to approve the minutes from February 15, 2018 as presented.

VOTE:

Yes 7 No 0 Abstain 0 Absent 2 (Larson and Pearson)

5. ALTERATION REVIEWS

Historic Design Review Case No. HIS18-11 for 440 State St

Major Historic Design Review of a proposal to modify the storefront and alter the side and rear facades of the Gray Belle Restaurant (C.1890), a contributing resource within the Salem Downtown Historic District, zoned CB (Central Business District), and located at 440 State Street 97301; Marion County Assessor’s Map and Tax Lot Number 073W27AB04900.

The Chair opened the hearing at 5:36 p.m. and directed staff to read the applicable criteria into the record. The Chair asked if there were any conflicts of interest or exparte contacts. There were none.

Kimberli Fitzgerald, Historic Preservation Officer, entered the Staff Report, all attachments and the presentation into the record. Ms. Fitzgerald then summarized the proposal and outlined the applicable criteria, highlighting each criterion and how specific proposal components addressed that criterion.

Staff Recommendation:

Based upon the information presented in the application, plans submitted for review, and findings as presented in this staff report, staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the application with the following Conditions:

CONDITION 1: The proposed elevator tower shall be clad in a traditional siding material currently found on the Gray Belle Building (brick; tile or Portland cement plaster).

CONDITION 2: The proposed vinyl windows on the rear (south) and east facades are not allowed. These windows shall either be of a traditional material (wood) or a paintable fiberglass or aluminum material.

CONDITION 3: The proposed new sectional doors on the alley façade shall be designed to be sliding, so when the doors are closed, they are flush with the brick façade.

Questions for Staff by: French, Hendrie

Persons Testifying

- Ron Ped, Architect, 6850 Burnett St SE, Salem

Questions for the applicant:

Neighborhood Association: None

Support:

- Josh Kay, Real Estate Agent for the property seller, 2074 Celeen Ave, SE Salem

Oppose: None

Neutral: None

Rebuttal: None

Additional questions for Staff:

With no further questions, the Chair closed the public hearing at 6:00 p.m. and the Commission proceeded to deliberations.

Motion: Move to approve Staff recommendation with conditions proposed.

Condition 1: The proposed elevator tower shall be clad in a traditional siding material currently found on the Gray Belle Building (brick; tile or Portland cement plaster).

Condition 2: The proposed vinyl windows on the rear (south) and east facades are not allowed. These windows shall either be of a traditional material (wood) or a paintable fiberglass or aluminum material.

Condition 3: The proposed new sectional doors on the alley façade shall be designed to be sliding, so when the doors are closed, they are flush with the brick façade.

Motion by: Commissioner Timbrook
Seconded by: Commissioner Hendrie

Questions or Comments by: Timbrook, Hendrie, Kerr, French, Schutte, Cottingham and Sund

Motion: Move to amend the original motion and modify Condition 3 to read “The proposed new doors on the alley façade shall be designed to be flush with the façade”.

Motion by: Commissioner Cottingham
Seconded by: Commissioner Schutte

Vote:

Aye:

Nay: Cottingham, Hendrie, French, Kerr, Sund, Schutte and Timbrook

Absent: Larson, Pearson

Abstentions:

Action: Motion failed.

Motion: Move to amend Condition 3 to read “The proposed new opening on the alley façade shall be flush with the brick façade and of materials traditionally found in the Downtown Historic District.”

Motion by: Commissioner Timbrook
Seconded by: Commissioner Schutte

Questions or Comments by: None

Vote:

Aye: Cottingham, Hendrie, French, Kerr, Sund, Schutte and Timbrook

Nay:

Absent: Larson, Pearson

Abstentions:

Action: Moved to amend Condition 3 to read “The proposed new opening on the alley façade shall be flush with the brick façade and of materials traditionally found in the Downtown Historic District”

Yes 7 No 0 Abstain 0 Absent 2 (Pearson & Larson)

Motion: Move to approve Staff recommendation with the amendment to Condition 3.

Motion by: Commissioner Timbrook

Seconded by: Commissioner Schutte

Vote:

Aye: Cottingham, Hendrie, French, Kerr, Sund, Schutte and Timbrook

Nay:

Absent: Larson, Pearson

Abstentions:

Action: Moved to approve Staff recommendation with the amendment to Condition 3.

Yes 7 No 0 Abstain 0 Absent 2 (Pearson & Larson)

.....
Historic Design Review Case No. HIS18-04 for 1811 Chemeketa St NE

Major Historic Design Review of a proposal to replace the non-historic failing front porch and bay window cinderblock foundation, porch, concrete steps, hand-rail and balustrades; replace the non-historic rear upper deck, railing and balustrades; replace the non-historic lower sunporch stairs, hand railing and balustrades; and replace 24 windows on the Daniel S. Yoder House (c.1891), a contributing resource within the Court/Chemeketa Residential Historic District, on property zoned RD (Duplex Residential) and located at 1811 Chemeketa Street NE, Marion County Tax Assessor Map and Tax Lot number: 073W26AB13500).

The Chair opened the hearing at 6:26 a.m. and directed staff to read the applicable criteria into the record. The Chair asked if there were any conflicts of interest or exparte contacts. There were none.

Kimberli Fitzgerald, Historic Preservation Officer, entered the Staff Report, all attachments and the presentation into the record. Ms. Fitzgerald then summarized the proposal and outlined the applicable criteria, highlighting each criterion and how specific proposal components addressed that criterion.

Staff Recommendation:

Based upon the information presented in the application, plans submitted for review, and findings as presented in this staff report, staff recommends that the Historic Landmarks Commission approve the application as presented.

Questions for Staff by: Timbrook and Kerr

Persons Testifying

- Rob Larson, applicant, 2159 E 17th, Eugene

Questions for the applicant: Kerr, Sund and Schutte

Neighborhood Association: None

Support: None

Oppose: None

Neutral: Ron Sterba 500 20th St NE None

Rebuttal: None

Additional questions for staff: None

With no further questions, the Chair closed the public hearing 6:43 and the Commission proceeded to deliberations.

Motion: Move to approve Staff recommendation.

Motion by: Commissioner Timbrook
Seconded by: Commissioner Hendrie

Questions or Comments by: Timbrook, Hendrie, Schutte, Kerr, Sund

Vote:

Aye: Cottingham, Hendrie, French, Kerr, Sund, Schutte and Timbrook

Nay:

Absent: Larson, Pearson

Abstentions:

Action: Moved to approve Staff recommendation.

VOTE:

Yes 7 No 0 Abstain 0 Absent 2 (Pearson & Larson)

The Commissioner took a 10 minute recess at 6:44 p.m.

The meeting reconvened at 6:58 p.m.

6. ACTION ITEMS:

a. Vote on Historic Photo Contest

The Economic & Recognition Incentives Sub-Committee made a recommendation to the Commission as a whole on their choices for the winning photos for the 2018 Historic Photo Contest.

At this time Commissioner Timbrook made a motion.

Motion: Move to approve the recommended photos that were selected by the Economic & Recognition Incentives Sub-Committee as the winning, honorable mention, youth and Chairman’s Choice winners for the 2018 Historic Photo Contest.

1st Place, Best Historic Place Category: Mill Creek from State Street
Honorable Mention, Place Category: Thomas Kay Woolen Mill
1st Place, Best Neighborhood Category: Pomeroy and Keen Clock
Honorable Mention, Neighborhood Category: State Street Corridor
1st Place, Best Historic Building Category: D.A. White Building
Honorable Mention, Building Category: Reed Opera House Ballroom
Chairman’s Choice Award: Cast Iron Façade (Ladd & Bush Bank Building)
Youth Category: There was a tie and Co-First Place goes to: Spring Time (Oregon State Capitol) and Timber Frame Pavilion.

Motion by: Commissioner Timbrook
Seconded by: Commissioner Schutte

Vote:
Aye: Cottingham, Hendrie, French, Kerr, Pearson, Sund, Schutte and Timbrook
Nay:
Absent: Larson, Pearson
Abstentions:

Action: Moved to approve the recommended photos that were selected by the Economic & Recognition Incentives Sub-Committee as the winning, honorable mention, youth and Chairman’s Choice winners for the 2018 Historic Photo Contest.

VOTE:

Yes 7 No 0 Abstain 0 Absent 2 (Pearson & Larson)

For the record, next year the Commission would like to have contestants submit photos and then let the Commission decide which categories the photo’s fall into. Also, next year contestants will be allowed to submit photos via Instagram.

7. DISCUSSION ITEMS: None

8. HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER REPORT:

- Update on the Qing Ming Festival and Cemetery Grant for interpretive panel
- Kimberli successfully defended her Archaeology Thesis
- Kimberli and Lisa Anderson-Ogilvie are attending the APA Conference in New Orleans
- Update on more excavations planned at Salem Pioneer Cemetery

- Kimberli gave a brief update on her trip to China

With no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned to Sub-Committees at 7:24 p.m.

Prepared by: *Sally Long, Recorder*
April 19, 2018

APPROVED: May, 17, 2018